

**Appendix 1: Photographs**

Photographs taken on Balaclava Road and Alma road adjoining the Roath Mill Conservation Area where “unsightly” bins are now a permanent feature 7 days a week.



Before and After





Appendix 2



Bag collection – before...



.....and after collection. No bins!



Collection with bags.....and with bins

## Appendix 2

### Appendix 2: Summary of news items from July 2015, with key extracts:

**01 JULY 2015 BY RUTH MOSALSKI**

#### **Cardiff bin changes come into force in less than a month but opponents criticise 'lack of consultation'**

The [council's cabinet member for the environment](#), Coun Bob Derbyshire, said: "Leaflets explaining the waste collection changes will be landing on doormats towards the end of the week. "Whilst acknowledging concerns that some people may have, it's important to remember why we're making the changes.

**He added: "I can also assure residents that the conservation areas have all been assessed against their criteria."**

**02 July 2015** By Tyler Mears

#### **Residents begin campaigning against Cardiff council's new bins strategy**

**Some of the new measures being brought in by Cardiff council have been described as 'outrageous'**

**03 July 2015**

**Cardiff Newsroom** <http://www.cardiffnewsroom.co.uk/index.php/archive/272-public-consultation-on-waste-collection-changes>

#### **Public consultation on Waste Collection Changes**

The cabinet member for environment at City of Cardiff Council has rejected suggestions that there was a lack of consultation over the council's waste collection changes.

Cabinet Member for Environment, Cllr. Bob Derbyshire said: 'The claim by some councillors that the public wasn't informed about these changes quite frankly beggars belief. We've had two city-wide consultation programmes, plus a comprehensive Ask Cardiff survey and we are currently embarking on a publicity campaign.'

**07 July 2015**

**Wales Online** By Ruth Mosalski

#### **Cardiff council defends wheelie bin scheme saying there has been consultation**

<http://www.walesonline.co.uk/news/wales-news/cardiff-council-defends-wheelie-bin-9608403>

Cardiff council has responded to criticism there has not been wide enough consultation about changes to the city's rubbish collections.

Petitions have sprung up across the city as awareness about changes to collection days and types grew.

**10 July 2015**

**Wales Online** Joe Boyle Letter

<http://www.walesonline.co.uk/incoming/western-mail-letters-friday-10-9628551>

#### **Residents should have been consulted**

**22 July 2015**

By Ruth Mosalski

<http://www.walesonline.co.uk/news/wales-news/bins-sent-homes-without-gardens-9710118>

#### **While some areas are reporting a 'mixed reaction' to the scheme, others are firmly against the scheme**

Bins being sent to homes with steps, garden bins for homes without gardens – the complaint list is growing. But there is some good news – if you don't want a large garden waste bin, a smaller bin is now on offer from Cardiff council.

"Why has our money been wasted on the unnecessary large garden bins? "I thought we were having reusable garden refuse bags, which would definitely be my preference. "I do not need the large garden bin, taking up room in my front garden. It is an eyesore, and needless."

**23 July 2015**

## Appendix 2

By Ruth Mosalski

<http://www.walesonline.co.uk/news/wales-news/protesters-march-cardiffs-city-hall-9717300>

### **Protesters march on Cardiff's City Hall with their wheelie bins**

Protesters banged their bin lids to protest about waste changes which have seen wheelie bins rolled out in terraced areas of the city

**23 July 2015**

<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-wales-south-east-wales-33642379>

### **Cardiff residents return 'waste of money' wheelie bins**

Angry residents have returned their new wheelie bins to Cardiff council saying they are a waste of money.

But protesters said the changes - which cost around £1.6m - had "ruined" the look of some areas and bins had been delivered to flats without gardens.

Cardiff council said 74.7% of people in a consultation wanted the new bins, although it would not confirm how many responses it had to the survey.

At a council meeting on Thursday night, members were also told 94,000 black refuse bins would be replaced with smaller ones at a cost of £1.4m

**27 July 2015**

<http://www.letsrecycle.com/news/latest-news/cardiff-collection-overhaul-underway/>

by Tom Goulding

### **Cardiff collection overhaul underway**

Councillor Bob Derbyshire, cabinet member for the environment, said he was aware that 'a few residents' had not welcomed the service change but argued 75% of those surveyed had agreed to expand the use of wheeled bins on the city.

"The new changes will cost just under £2million but when this is compared to the fines that could be imposed if statutory recycling targets are missed, this is certainly money well spent."

**27 July 2015** By WalesOnline

### **The new rules for Cardiff waste collections come into force TODAY - and residents face fines if they don't follow them**

<http://www.walesonline.co.uk/news/wales-news/new-rules-cardiff-waste-collections-9731171#rIabs=7>

Cabinet member for the environment, Councillor Bob Derbyshire said: "I know a few residents haven't welcomed moving to a wheeled bin service.

"But I'd like to point out that when we consulted with the public prior to the changes just under 75% of those surveyed agreed that we should expand the use of wheeled bins in the city."

A press release from Cardiff council states: "The new changes will cost just under £2 million but when this is compared to the fines that could be imposed if statutory recycling targets are missed, this is certainly money well spent."

**27 July 2015**

### **Challenging recycling targets lead to bin collection changes**

**BBC News** By Chris Wood

In an effort to meet this target, Cardiff council has spent £1.6 million on waste collection changes that include reducing the size of its black refuse bins and sending out green waste wheelie bins.

Some residents, who don't have gardens, called the new green bins a "waste of money" and protested by taking them to city hall last Thursday, saying they "ruined" the look of the area. Alison Hambury in Llandaff North, Cardiff, said "I'm all for recycling, I just don't really see the point of all the bins and I don't see how we're saving money,"

**29 July 2015**

**RESOURCE magazine**

### **Cardiff begins new waste service**

By Annie Kane



## Appendix 2

<http://resource.co/article/cardiff-begins-new-waste-service-10335>

A petition has also been launched to 'stop the introduction of wheelie bins to terraced streets in Cardiff'. It has so far gained 320 signatories.

The petition is addressed to cabinet member for the environment, Councillor Bob Derbyshire, who said: "I know a few residents haven't welcomed moving to a wheeled bin service. But I'd like to point out that when we consulted with the public prior to the changes just under 75 per cent of those surveyed agreed that we should expand the use of wheeled bins in the city."

### 30 JULY 2015

**Just 0.5% of Cardiff residents responded to a survey which shaped city's waste changes**  
BY RUTH MOSALSKI

**Campaigners and opposition groups have reacted angrily to news of the size of the consultation**

Just 0.5% of Cardiff residents responded to a survey which shaped the city's waste changes. Councillor Bob Derbyshire, who has responsibility for bins, has repeatedly told campaigners that 75% of those questioned in a council survey in 2013/14 agreed that the use of wheelie bins in the city should be expanded.

But the number of people who answered a question asking "Should the council expand the use of wheeled bins instead of black bag collections?" was just 1,881.

The report does not ask for opinions about green garden waste bins – which have been delivered to 4,266 homes. But the survey did ask respondents how many of them used garden waste bins and 27% said they did.

Another question asked "which of these schemes would you prefer?"

Of those who responded, 45% said they wanted green bags for recycling and 29% said they wanted wheelie bins for recycling.

The question did not give an option for a wheelie garden waste bin or a wheelie non-recyclable waste bin. Of those questioned, 69% already used wheelie bins.

A document called Waste Strategy Survey – A 2025 vision for Cardiff was published showing each answer. Campaigners and opposition groups have all responded angrily.

Leader of the [Lib Dem](#) group Judith Woodman said: "The consultation was woefully inadequate.

[Conservative](#) group leader Dianne Rees said she was not surprised by the figures.

She said her group does not believe the proposals will improve recycling rates. "There is always room for some improvement but the hugely expensive changes in bins is not justified," she added.

Penylan resident Ian Layzell said campaigners and their Lib Dem ward councillors had conducted their own survey. They delivered forms to about 500 households and received 310 back. Almost 90% said no to bins and yes to bags.

### 06 AUGUST 2015

**Wales Online** BY HUW SILK

**Cardiff council branded heavy-handed for issuing hundreds of warnings over bin collections – and threatening £100 fines**

**The council says people who leave out the wrong bags will be issued with a notice then fined if they do so again**

Hundreds of people in Cardiff have been issued with notices in the last week which warn them to leave their bins out for collection correctly – or face a £100 fine.

Many residents have said the changes are unnecessary, with others complaining they were not given enough notice about the move.

Now council warnings to residents over what could happen if they put out the wrong bins have been branded heavy-handed by a city councillor.

A spokesman added that since Swansea council introduced a three bag per fortnight limit for general waste, the recycling level in the city has increased by 5%.

### 26 AUGUST 2015

## Appendix 2

### **Wales Online BY HUW SILK**

**'For a bit of short-term pain in terms of politics this is the right thing to do' Councillor in charge of overhauling Cardiff bin system insists there was no option but to make change Bob Derbyshire said he hoped people would 'settle down' to the changes – but condemned personal abuse he has received**

The councillor in charge of introducing Cardiff's new bin regime has insisted there was little option but to introduce new smaller bins.

Bob Derbyshire, the city council's cabinet member for environment, also suggested he might have been forced to impose the new system even if people had opposed the plans in a prior consultation.

And with many residents speaking out about the effect the wheelie bins have on Cardiff's streetscape, Coun Derbyshire said: "A lot of people are complaining about the aesthetics of it, saying an ugly bin in my front garden doesn't look nice.

"My answer to that is I would rather have that than being left with the situation we were in, so for me it's the practicalities."

### **18 SEP 2015**

**'Cause for concern' about Cardiff council's finances as report reveals £6m projected overspend in four months**

**BY RUTH MOSALSKI**

Four months into the financial year and Cardiff council is £6m overspent

There is "cause for concern" about Cardiff council's finances after it was revealed the authority is projected to be £6m overspent just four months into the financial year.

But councillors are confident they will get back on track by the end of the financial year – despite the estimated average £1.5m-a-month overspend. This year Cardiff council has a budget gap of £48.3m to meet.

### **17 September 2015**

**Bill for Cardiff council's new wheelie bins comes in at £1.1m less than expected**

**By Ruth Mosalski**

The controversial scheme was estimated to cost £2.4m, instead the latest estimate is they will cost just £1.3m

In total it is estimated 93,000 homes which had larger bins are having them replaced with smaller bins and another 4,500 are being given to homes which previously used bags.

The Labour-run council had said it would cost £2.1m to roll out 93,000 new bins - with each bin estimated to cost around £23. Another £300,000 was set aside for further roll out of the scheme. But the revised estimate is a total bill of £1.3m - around £13 per bin.

Corporate Director Christine Salter writes: "The budget of £2.4m for restricting residual waste, by changing the current 240L bins to 140L is reported to underspend by £1.1m, which will be used to reduce the council's borrowing requirement. "This is due to prices at tender being lower than expected."

She added that the difference in figures would allow them to borrow less.

Coun Rees asked: "How did we get it so wrong? That's a huge difference.

Councillor Woodman said: "I find it incredible that the response given was down to procurement. "Someone somewhere cannot do their sums. This difference is not down to bulk purchase discount. Once again it shows the incompetence of the administration."

### **Private Eye Sept 2015: 'Rubbish Plans'**

Cardiff Council is making an awful mess of rubbish.

## Appendix 2

### Appendix 3: The “Consultation”

- 1.1. ‘Consultation’ in a legal sense (and in everyday use) means telling people what is being proposed and then asking for their views on that proposal.
- 1.2. The Council have persistently claimed to have ‘consulted’ over the roll-out of smaller black bins for the collection of residual waste. Indeed, infamously, Councillor Derbyshire claimed *‘It beggars belief* that residents could not know about the changes and stated<sup>1</sup>: *“I know a few residents haven’t welcomed moving to a wheeled bin service. But I’d like to point out that when we consulted with the public prior to the changes just under 75 percent of those surveyed agreed that we should expand the use of wheeled bins in the city.”*
- 1.3. Through correspondence with Jane Cherrington originally (and more recently the legal department of Cardiff Council) and separate correspondence with the Cardiff Research Group we have attempted to establish where and when residents were asked: ‘We are proposing to introduce smaller-sized black bins across the whole City (with some minor exceptions). What do you think?’ or ‘Do you agree with replacing bags with bins?’ and precisely which documents are claimed to be the evidence of such consultation. It has proved extremely difficult to elicit any clear answers from anyone.
- 1.4. The paper before cabinet in April 2015 clearly places reliance only on: *‘Consultation Report: outline waste management strategy, 2015 - 2018’* and states that the findings including *“there was general support for more wheeled bins”*. The survey (open between November ‘14 and January ‘15) in fact contained only one hypothetical question (see p.32) which asked whether to reduce waste respondents preferred **‘A smaller wheeled bin (or equivalent amount of bags for the bagged areas) collected once a fortnight’**.
- 1.5. This wording in fact gives residents the impression that bagged areas will continue to have bags (albeit with restrictions on capacity). Such a wording is, to say the least, obscure, if not deliberately misleading (given that the operational decision to increase bins had already been taken in 2014).
- 1.6. The Council now agree that the cabinet paper is wrong<sup>2</sup>. The Council (and Mr Derbyshire in statements) appear to rely on earlier surveys and in particular *“Waste Strategy Survey - a 2025 vision of Cardiff”* (open between September 2013 and December 2015). The key statistic relied on from this survey is that 74.7% of respondents agreed the Council should ‘expand the use of wheeled bins instead of black bag collections’ (p.30).
- 1.7. This statistic has been interpreted to mean ‘everyone should have bins’. This is utterly mistaken because in the same survey 66.7% of those respondents also agreed that the Council should ‘provide bespoke bags to those living in bag areas to limit the amount of general waste’ (p. 24).
- 1.8. Also, in this survey, **61.6% of respondents were opposed to the introduction of smaller bins** (p. 29) and **82.8% indicated that smaller bins would not encourage them to recycle more** (p.30). These key statistics were not provided to the Cabinet at the time the decision to introduce smaller bins was reached (The only statistic which supported the introduction of more wheeled bins – the 75% allegedly in favour of bins - conveniently stated to have been the result of the later survey). Of even greater concern is that it was not until a public clamour grew around the figure of 75% that this survey was ever actually published by the council in July 2015<sup>3</sup>, meaning that neither the public nor Councillors knew, or took account of, the results of the survey when making their decision.
- 1.9. Further and despite repeated requests, the Cardiff Research Team have refused to disclose critical details about how the alleged consultations have been conducted. For example they claim to have no data about how many surveys were paper questionnaires returned (surely they are in a box which could be counted?). Lack of this absolutely basic data raises serious questions about the integrity of these alleged consultations, irrespective of their content.

---

<sup>1</sup> Council Press Release 24/7/15

<sup>2</sup> Letter from Clive Pursey, Solicitor to Sarah Jones dated 15/9/15

<sup>3</sup> The operator of the @cityofcardiff twitter account could not locate a copy until early August ‘15 and then stated it had not been published until 31<sup>st</sup> July ‘15. The council in subsequent correspondence have said it was published on 5<sup>th</sup> July but was moved to a “more accessible” part of the website on 31<sup>st</sup> July.

# How recycling changes in Cardiff will affect you

## MAIN AIMS

Increase recycling and composting rates by reducing black bag/bin waste to hit Welsh Government's recycling targets. For every 1% we miss we face a **£400k** fine

## RECYCLING TARGETS

- 2014/15 recycling target ▶ 52%
- 2015/16 recycling target ▶ 58%
- Welsh Government recycling target by 2025 ▶ 70%

SO WE NEED

LESS OF THESE ▶ & MORE OF THESE

## MAIN WASTE COLLECTION CHANGES

To help you do this we are making these changes

In bag areas around the city

HOW WE COLLECT NOW

Reduce waste    Recycle more    Compost more    Compost more

↓ ↓ ↓ ↓

HOW WE WILL COLLECT IN FUTURE

Each household will receive Council issued red-striped bags, twice a year, for general waste. No other types of bag will be collected. You will receive enough bags to put out 3 or less per fortnight.

Green recycling bags will continue to be collected as normal every week

Continue using your brown kerbside caddy for your food waste every week

Biobags for garden waste will be replaced with reusable sacks, collected as normal

Existing black & green bin areas

HOW WE COLLECT NOW

Reduce waste    Recycle more    Compost more    Compost more

↓ ↓ ↓ ↓

HOW WE WILL COLLECT IN FUTURE

Around 90,000 households with 240L black bins will have those exchanged for smaller 140L bins, collected every fortnight

Green recycling bags will continue to be collected as normal every week

Continue using your brown kerbside caddy for your food waste every week

Continue to use your green bins for garden waste as normal

## OTHER CHANGES

Around 5,500 households to have a new 140L black bin and reusable garden sacks - this accommodates properties that cannot store a 240L green bin

Around 4,500 households which currently use black bags will receive a new 140L black bin and a 240L green garden waste bin, instead of red-striped bags

Registered larger families will have additional support. The hygiene collection service will continue.

Detailed information will be delivered to households before the changeover [www.cardiff.gov.uk/recyclemore](http://www.cardiff.gov.uk/recyclemore)